

Advice on establishing the prevalence of non-recent child sexual abuse in Northern Ireland

October 2023

RECOMMENDATION AND SUMMARY

The Commissioner recommends that a survey of the prevalence of sexual violence and abuse, including historical/non-recent child sexual abuse, be considered in Northern Ireland.

It was a key recommendation of the 2019 Gillen report to conduct research into the 'prevalence, extent, nature and experience of serious sexual offences'.

The prevalence research being proposed for consideration will enable government, statutory agencies and service providers to more effectively plan, resource and implement responses and services for victims and survivors of historical/non-recent child sexual abuse.

In line with current strategic and policy developments in Northern Ireland, including the Ending Violence against Women and Girls, and the Domestic and Sexual Abuse strategies, a focus on prevalence of historical/non-recent child sexual abuse is timely. It should be noted that a wider prevalence study of child abuse could be carried out which would incorporate child sexual abuse. Examples are provided in **Appendix 2**. Such a study would also fit with the wider study of Adverse Childhood Experiences in the population. In light of recommendations and developments in the wider strategy and policy environment and the very real presenting needs of victims, the Commissioner would advocate in the first instance a survey of the prevalence of sexual violence and abuse, including historical/non-recent child sexual abuse, be considered in Northern Ireland.

The impact of child sexual abuse on victims and survivors, including the frequency/intensity of interventions and resources which can also be significant even when a history of child sexual abuse is not disclosed, will be explored later in the paper. The implications for individual victims, communities, statutory and non-statutory service providers and policy-makers are stark. There are also financial implications which the Home Office has outlined in its recent report on the economic and social cost of child sexual abuse which will be explored later in the paper. See also **Appendix 2**.

The proposed study could draw on the recent Republic of Ireland model outlined at **Appendix 2**. This study is relevant for its capture of data relating to non-recent abuse, the perpetrator profile and the settings in which abuse occurred.



We have previously brought this proposal to the attention of officials leading on the Ending Violence Against Women and Girls Strategy and the Domestic and Sexual Abuse Strategy 2023-2030.



The case for a prevalence study into non-recent child sexual abuse in Northern Ireland

The knowledge of child sexual abuse—the recognition of its prevalence and the reality of its impact—has been lost and found in repeated cycles within society . . . ¹

The Commissioner for Survivors of Institutional Childhood Abuse (COSICA) was established by the Historical Institutional Abuse (Northern Ireland) Act 2019. The Commissioner's principal aim is to promote the interests of any person who suffered abuse while a child and while resident in an institution at some time between 1922 and 1995 (both inclusive). The Act requires the Commissioner to "provide advice on matters concerning the interests of victims and survivors to the Executive Office or a person providing services to victims and survivors... on whatever other occasions the Commissioner thinks appropriate" and empowers her to "make representations or recommendations to any person about matters concerning the interests of victims and survivors" ².

It was a key recommendation of the 2019 Gillen report to conduct research into the 'prevalence, extent, nature and experience of serious sexual offences'³. Without adequate data, we are trying to support victims and survivors of child sexual abuse in a vacuum. This concern was also raised by the Northern Ireland Auditor's Office (NIAO) in 2019, in relation to historical institutional childhood abuse. The NIAO stated that 'data on the number of children who resided in residential homes over the period in question (1922 to 1995) is not complete and the Department is therefore currently unable to provide a reliable estimate of the numbers of eligible victims and survivors'⁴.

While not claiming that a prevalence study on child sexual abuse including historical/non-recent child sexual abuse would provide the answer to how many victims and survivors of historical/non-recent child abuse are in the population, such a study would at least provide an insight into incidence of historical/non-recent child sexual abuse as it occurred institutions. In the Historical Institutional Abuse Inquiry, sexual abuse was one of the two main areas of complaint. Physical abuse often occurred in tandem with sexual abuse⁵. Researching the incidence of historical/non-recent child sexual abuse in an institutional context could provide valuable insight. It may also go some way to partially engaging with NIAO concerns in at least providing some parameters around the potential scope of financial redress compensation.

The absence of such research highlights the challenges around understanding the wider incidence of child abuse/child sexual abuse and historical/non-recent child abuse which is compounded by relatively low disclosure rates among victims and

¹Joanne Stubley and Danny Taggart, British Journal of Psychotherapy (2023) 1–6

 $^{{}^2}Functions\ of\ the\ Commissioner:\ \underline{https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2019/31/part/2/crossheading/functions/enacted}$

³ gillen-report-may-2019.pdf (justice-ni.gov.uk)

⁴ Report by the C&AG on The Executive Office – Annual Report and Accounts 2019-20.pdf (niauditoffice.gov.uk)

⁵ <u>Historical Institutional Abuse Inquiry - Report Chapters | Historical institutional Abuse Inquiry (hiainquiry.org)</u>



survivors; many of whom are battling trauma and shame as a result of having been abused.

While the Commissioner recognises that research into all forms of child abuse is needed, in line with current strategic and policy developments in Northern Ireland, including the Ending Violence against Women and Girls and the Domestic and Sexual Abuse strategies, we are recommending that a survey into the prevalence of child sexual abuse in all of its forms, including historical/non-recent institutional child sexual abuse, be considered in Northern Ireland.

The Commissioner is concerned here with 'historical/non-recent' child sexual abuse: referring to abuse which occurred before an adult victim and survivor was 18 years old⁶, and may have occurred many years ago. This follows the recent Republic of Ireland survey, which focused on abuse that occurred before the victim and survivor was 17 (the legal age of consent in the Republic of Ireland)⁷. The survey found a prevalence rate of childhood contact sexual violence of 20%. This timely publication may be helpful to consider in the context of establishing prevalence data in Northern Ireland⁸.

The Commissioner wishes to draw attention to this model because it has yielded vital information about the prevalence of sexual violence in the Republic of Ireland, including reference to historical/non-recent abuse and information regarding settings of abuse and profiles of perpetrators. It shows, for example, that 7% of adults who experienced unwanted contact sexual violence as a child experienced it from a person in authority. The survey also finds that disclosure rates (not necessarily to police) are around 47%, indicating that sexual abuse is significantly more prevalent than we know. That figure is understood in the context of very real trauma victims and survivors live with as a result of the abuse perpetrated on them.

The Commissioner witnesses firsthand the long term effects of child sexual abuse on adult victims and survivors of historical/ non-recent child abuse. In the Historical Institutional Abuse Inquiry, sexual abuse was one of the two main areas of complaint. Physical abuse often occurred in tandem with sexual abuse⁹. The pervasive, lifelong effects of child sexual abuse are well-documented. The Adverse Childhood Experiences study¹⁰ found that childhood adversity (including sexual abuse) affects adults throughout their lives as a primary cause of mental illness, addiction and chronic disease. Research on the social impacts of institutional child abuse, for example, finds victims and survivors often report adverse outcomes to both interpersonal relationships and self-regulatory behaviours. Social and relational difficulties, parenting difficulties, substance abuse, criminal behaviour and revictimisation, as well as feelings of shame, guilt and self-blame are among the negative impacts¹¹. Researchers have also found that institutional child sexual abuse

⁶ Non-recent abuse | NSPCC

⁷ <u>Sexual Violence Survey 2022 – Main Results - CSO - Central Statistics Office</u>

⁸ See Appendix 2 for further discussion of this survey.

⁹ Historical Institutional Abuse Inquiry - Report Chapters | Historical institutional Abuse Inquiry (hiainquiry.org)

¹⁰ Developed in 1998 by Felitti. Now known as PACES (Positive and Adverse Childhood Experiences)

¹¹ The-impacts-of-institutional-child-sexual-abuse--A-rapid 2017 Child-Abuse---.pdf



is associated with vicarious trauma at the individual, family and community level. Where abuse occurs in religious settings, there are implications for the spiritual wellbeing of victims and survivors¹².

Child sexual abuse of all forms has far-reaching implications for public health, justice, technology, education, and the economy. The Home Office's recent report¹³ on the economic and social cost of contact child sexual abuse estimates the financial and monetised non-financial cost relating to all survivors who experienced child sexual abuse in England and Wales in the year up until April 2019 as at least £10.1 billion. 64% of these costs are borne by victims and survivors, the rest by governments. The costs include prevention, education, treatment, justice, physical and emotional harms to victims and survivors, and lost economic output.

The recent final report from the Independent Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse (IICSA) in England and Wales¹⁴ estimates that 1 in 6 girls and 1 in 20 boys experience sexual abuse before the age of 16. This represents a population level estimate of 3.1 million adults in England and Wales having experienced child sexual abuse. Other international studies bear this out. The Australian Child Maltreatment Study¹⁵ found a 28.5% rate of child sexual abuse. In North America¹⁶ it was 10.4%. Global estimates ranged from 8 to 31% for girls and 3 to 17% for boys¹⁷.

There is critical consensus that adequate data collection is both an essential and largely absent tool in current global efforts to support victims and survivors and prevent sexual violence. We already know that statistics for sexual crimes do not show the full prevalence of child sexual abuse. The NSPCC, for example, reports that findings from research studies reveal much higher numbers of children who have been abused than statistics provided by services, which demonstrates the significant under-reporting in this area. Evidence suggests that more people will disclose abuse during research because they may do so anonymously and confidentially, without concern about an investigation from the authorities or the effect on their family 19. Prevalence data will also yield information about the profile of those who harm children, with some evidence suggesting that around 40% of institutional child sexual abuse could result from harmful sexual behaviour displayed by other children under 18 years 20. This has significant implications for how we work with victims and survivors.

¹² The impacts of institutional child sexual abuse: A rapid review of the evidence - ScienceDirect

¹³ The economic and social cost of contact child sexual abuse - GOV.UK (www.gov.uk)

¹⁴ https://www.iicsa.org.uk/final-rport

¹⁵ The Australian Child Maltreatment Study (ACMS)

¹⁶ Prevalence and Correlates of Child Sexual Abuse: A National Study - PMC (nih.gov)

¹⁷ The current prevalence of child sexual abuse worldwide: a systematic review and meta-analysis - PubMed (nih.gov)

¹⁸ NSPCC UK Website: <u>https://learning.nspcc.org.uk/statistics-child-abuse</u>

¹⁹ https://learning.nspcc.org.uk/statistics-child-abuse

²⁰ There are varying data on sexual abuse by peers. See <u>The impacts of institutional child sexual abuse: A rapid review of the evidence - ScienceDirect</u>. See also the final report of the Australian Royal Commission into Institutional Responses to Child Abuse, which finds that sixty-three per cent of survivors indicated they were the target of another child's harmful sexual behaviour in historical residential and foster care or contemporary out-of-home care. <u>Final Report - Volume 2</u>, Nature and cause (childabuseroyalcommission.gov.au)



The lack of data on child sexual abuse can be considered in the context of human rights: the United Nations Committee on the Rights of the Child, in the fifth periodic report of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (CRC/C/GBR/5) recommends that governments: "Strengthen the systematic collection of data and recording of information on violence against children, including domestic violence, gender-based violence, abuse and neglect, in all settings, and the sharing of information and referral of cases among relevant sectors"²¹.

Establishing baseline data will make not only the extent of child sexual abuse, but also victims and survivors themselves, visible, and place them at the centre of efforts to support them. Stubley and Taggart²² note that the Truth Panel, (one arm of the Independent Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse), heard testimony from over 6000 adult survivors of child sexual abuse. This 'created a new space for speaking about [child sexual abuse], that is 'more stable and culturally validated' and potentially fills 'a lacuna that has surrounded responses to non-recent [child sexual abuse], a gap created because of ... failures in recognizing ... the scale of the problem.' However, the report concludes that the lack of reliable data which measure the current prevalence of child sexual abuse in England and Wales (and across the UK) impedes the ability of statutory agencies and society more generally to prevent and respond appropriately to child sexual abuse.

Current important initiatives such as the Ending Violence Against Women and Girls Strategic Framework and the Domestic and Sexual Abuse Strategy tie in very closely with the need to estimate the prevalence of child sexual abuse in Northern Ireland. The Domestic and Sexual Abuse Strategy, for example, highlights a 'need for local research and disaggregated data to inform policy and service development²³.' Recent reports published in Northern Ireland including 'Every Voice Matters' and 'It's Just What Happens' show that sexual violence increasingly affects women and girls. 'Every Voice Matters' shows that 50% of girls experience a form of violence or abuse before the age of 11, and that 8% of girls experience child sexual abuse²⁴.

There is an opportunity to build on this important work, to understand the prevalence of child sexual abuse more broadly. The extent of child sexual abuse in Northern Ireland, affecting both girls and boys, is still not known, and the policy landscape remains fragmented. The results of a comprehensive prevalence survey will provide a baseline for levels of sexual abuse and violence in Northern Ireland, focusing service provision for victims and survivors, driving policy and interventions to treat, recompense and prevent child sexual abuse. The research will not reflect the reality of those who experienced sexual abuse and violence in these institutions, and who have died, many before their time. Nor will it reveal the reality of those who left Northern Ireland and who now live elsewhere. This research is important for children in Northern Ireland and the adults they will become. It also matters for the adult victims and survivors and the children they once were.

²¹ UN Committee on the Rights of the Child (2016) Concluding observation to the UK state party, para 43(b) Available at: <u>Treaty bodies Search (ohchr.org)</u>

 $^{^{22}}$ Joanne Stubley and Danny Taggart, British Journal of Psychotherapy y 00, 0 (2023) 1–6 2023

²³ dsa strategy consultation paper.PDF (justice-ni.gov.uk)

²⁴ Ending Violence Against Women and Girls | The Executive Office (executiveoffice-ni.gov.uk)



Appendix 1: Policy Context

A prevalence study will support the work of the Commissioner in promoting the interests of victims and survivors of historical institutional childhood abuse and seeking to create a legacy approach of positive action to acknowledge the scale and impact of such abuse and plan accordingly.

The findings of a prevalence study could have implications for departments and agencies working across education, health, communities, and justice where the impact and legacy of childhood abuse on supports and services can be most acutely felt, and where reliable data can allow responses to be better planned, traumainformed and resourced.

The study will also support an Outcomes based approach to the Programme for Government, which promotes the need for a whole societal approach, drawing together scientific and technical expertise and the use of relevant data to target resources where need is greatest and monitoring arrangements to track the impact of interventions should be in place.

It will provide an opportunity for cross-departmental engagement and support the delivery of strategic and policy priorities for government, tying in with current initiatives such as the Ending Violence Against Women and Girls Strategic Framework and the Domestic and Sexual Abuse Strategy.

The study will drive state responses to systemic failures to prevent and respond to non-recent child abuse. This concern was identified by the Northern Ireland Audit Office²⁵ in relation to the financial compensation redress scheme established for victims and survivors of historical/non-recent institutional childhood abuse.

Studies such as these are perceived to potentially cause high distress to participants. However, the recent Australian Child Maltreatment Survey found that participant distress is infrequent and transitory, and that it is possible to fulfil ethical requirements to participants and demonstrate trauma-informed practice. Even distressed participants maintained that their involvement was worthwhile.²⁶

²⁵ These comments were made in 2019

²⁶ Improving measurement of child abuse and neglect: A systematic review and analysis of national prevalence studies | PLOS ONE



Appendix 2 COMPARATIVE TABLE OF PREVALENCE STUDIES

Jurisdiction Republic of	Description of study The recent Republic of Ireland's Sexual	Findings The survey looked at child and adult	Overall prevalence of child sexual abuse (CSA) rate (%)	Relevance to a Northern Ireland prevalence study (low, medium, high)
Ireland	Violence Survey (2022) provides one possible model. This survey was led by the Department of Justice, with cross-departmental actions and initiatives, following a recommendation in the Republic's national Domestic, Sexual and Gender-based Violence Strategy. The survey was carried out by the Central Statistics Office (CSO). The survey, asked of adults in Ireland, captures lifetime prevalence grouped into two main categories: non-consensual sexual experiences when the respondent was 17 and older, and when the respondent was 16 and younger (the legal age of consent in the Republic is 17).	sexual violence occurring in the past. The report found that 20% of adults experienced contact sexual violence as a child. Women experienced roughly the same levels of sexual violence as children and as adults. The report noted that women were almost four times likelier than men to have experienced sexual violence, both as an adult and as a child. This disparity is consistent with the findings of other reports listed here. The survey also collected information that could provide a picture of perpetrators. While they were not identified by name, descriptors such as teacher, family friend, etc, indicated that 78% of respondents knew the perpetrator.	contact sexual violence as a child	This survey yielded important information about sexual violence that occurred in the past, both to adults and children. The survey questions around perpetrators and settings of abuse are especially relevant to non-recent abuse.
United Kingdom	Office of National Statistics (ONS) In April 2022, the ONS explored the feasibility of a survey measuring child abuse in the UK and concluded that there was no reason not to conduct a survey. ONS has recommended that a survey of	N/A	N/A	Medium This will be a highly specific study focused on children aged 11 to 15 years. It will yield vital information about non-recent sexual abuse of



Jurisdiction	Description of study	Findings	Overall prevalence of child sexual abuse (CSA) rate (%)	Relevance to a Northern Ireland prevalence study (low, medium, high)
	children aged 11 to 15 years should be administered in a supportive school environment. ONS is currently at the pilot phase of this survey.			children, however it will be limited to children in this age group.
Australia	In 2012, Australia announced a Royal Commission into institutional responses to child abuse. The final report included the following recommendation: The Australian Government should conduct and publish a nationally representative prevalence study on a regular basis to establish the extent of child maltreatment in institutional and non-institutional contexts in Australia.	The primary findings of the Australian Child Maltreatment Study were launched in April 2023. Surveying ages 16 to 65, the study found that 32% experienced physical abuse, 28.5% experienced sexual abuse, 30.9% experienced emotional abuse, 8.9% experienced neglect, 39.6% experienced exposure to domestic violence. A key finding is that child maltreatment is not something that happened only in the past; it is happening to 1 in 4 children in Australia now. The study also found that most people experienced more than one type of maltreatment, and that the median duration of this was years. This is a complex problem which is more difficult to treat than single maltreatment and is associated with poorer outcomes. The study found that child maltreatment is a gendered problem, affecting girls disproportionately. Girls were found to experience significantly	28.5%	Medium/High This study of child maltreatment covered five types of maltreatment, surveying over 8,000 participants. It yielded information about the occurrence of child maltreatment both now and in the past. If adopted for a Northern Ireland context it would go beyond sexual violence to reveal other types of child abuse. There is much to learn from its methodology.



Jurisdiction	Description of study	Findings	Overall prevalence of child sexual abuse (CSA) rate (%)	Relevance to a Northern Ireland prevalence study (low, medium, high)
		higher rates of emotional and sexual abuse, with 1 in 3 compared to 1 in 7 males. The study also sought to determine the associated impact on key health outcomes throughout life. It found that 40.2% of those who experienced child maltreatment qualified for a mental health diagnosis. Other implications included an increased likelihood to smoke, have obesity, to have engaged in self-harm and to have attempted suicide. Surveying different age groups made it possible to identify trends, i.e., a lower proportion of young people reported experiencing physical abuse, compared to the older generation. Sexual abuse by parents and caregivers in the home was also found to be declining. However other types of abuse such as emotional		
North America	The National Intimate Partner and Sexual Violence Survey (ongoing)	abuse are becoming more prevalent. One in 4 women (26.8% or 33.5 million) in the United States reported		Medium This survey presents key
	The National Intimate Partner and Sexual	completed or attempted rape		findings on the prevalence of
	Violence Survey (NISVS) is an ongoing	victimization at some point in her		sexual violence in the United
	survey that collects the most current and	lifetime. (2.3% or about 2.9 million)		States. Its focus on different
	comprehensive national- and state-level	reported rape victimization in the 12		types of sexual violence, and
	data on intimate partner violence, sexual	months before the survey. About 1 in		its regularity of repetition,



Jurisdiction	Description of study	Findings	Overall prevalence of child sexual abuse (CSA) rate (%)	Relevance to a Northern Ireland prevalence study (low, medium, high)
	violence and stalking victimisation in the United States.	26 men (3.8% or 4.5 million) in the United States reported completed or attempted rape victimization at some point in his lifetime (Figure 2, Table 2). Less than 1% (0.3 or 340,000) reported rape victimization in the 12 months before the survey (Table 2)		generates a complex picture of the prevalence of sexual violence. However, it does not have a focus on children.
	Prevalence and Correlates of Child Sexual Abuse (CSA) This study examines the prevalence, correlates, and psychiatric disorders of adults with history of child sexual abuse (CSA). More than 34,000 adults aged 18 years and older residing in households were face-to-face interviewed in a survey conducted during the 2004–2005 period.	The prevalence of CSA was 10.14% (24.8% men and 75.2% women, a disparity in keeping with the Rol SVS). Child physical abuse, maltreatment, and neglect were more prevalent among individuals with CSA than among those without it. The frequency, type, and number of CSA were significantly correlated with psychopathology.	10.14%	Medium/high This study focused on CSA and linked it with other types of abuse, such as emotional abuse and neglect. It asked questions with a rank from 1 to 5, where people who answered 5 had no history of abuse, and those who answered other numbers did. The study finds a high prevalence of CSA (10%) but not as high as the Rol finding of 20%. While differing methodologies make it difficult to compare the findings of studies in different jurisdictions, it does point to the value of country-specific studies.
Canada (Quebec)	Prevalence of Sexual Abuse among Children and Youth	14.4% of girls and 3.5% of boys reported unwanted sexual activities involving touching, while 5.3% of girls	14.4% of girls, 3.5% of boys	Medium Like the (currently in pilot phase) Office for National



Jurisdiction	Description of study	Findings	Overall prevalence of child sexual abuse (CSA) rate (%)	Relevance to a Northern Ireland prevalence study (low, medium, high)
	The objective of this study (conducted in 2011/12) was to estimate the prevalence of child sexual abuse in a representative sample of Quebec high school youths and document its associations with mental health problems and health-risk behaviours. The target population included all students in Grades 10 to 12 attending public and private schools in Quebec.	and 1.4% of boys reported forced sexual relations involving penetration, for an overall prevalence of 14.9% for teenage girls and 3.9% for teenage boys. Both unwanted touching (χ 2 = 261.75, P <.001) and abuse involving penetration (χ 2 = 83.03, P <.001) were reported more frequently by girls compared to boys.		Statistics study, this study surveyed children to ascertain the prevalence of child sexual abuse. However, it did not have a focus on adults, and was not able to show differences among different age groups. An overall prevalence of 14% places this study between the North American and Rol studies.
Germany	Child Maltreatment in Germany This study was conducted in 2016, examining a representative sample of the German population for childhood maltreatment using the Childhood Trauma Questionnaire.	Overall, 2.6% (f: 3.9%, m: 1.2%) of all participants reported severe emotional abuse, 3.3% (f: 3.4%, m: 3.3%) severe physical abuse, 2.3% (f: 3.7%, m: 0.7%) severe sexual abuse, 7.1% (f: 8.1%, m: 5.9%) severe emotional neglect and 9% (f: 9.2%, m: 8.9%) severe physical neglect. Women were more likely to report at least moderate sexual and emotional abuse than men. The largest difference between age groups was reported for physical neglect, with participants aged over 70 years reporting the highest rates.	2.3%	Medium This was a smaller study, involving 2,500 participants, and focusing on child maltreatment. As with the Australian Childhood Maltreatment Study, this study yielded information about five types of child maltreatment. A finding of 2.3% for severe sexual abuse is low compared to other jurisdictions, but as mentioned above, aims and methodologies differ.